

### Revista Turismo em Análise - RTA | ISSN: 1984-4867

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.11606/issn.1984-4867.v28i1p149-168

Articles and essays

# Tourism Planning Based on the Actor-Centered Power Perspective in the Ilha Grande State Park, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Carolina Dutra de Araujo<sup>a</sup> Débora Regina Campos Cândido<sup>b</sup> Max Krott<sup>c</sup>

#### **Abstract**

Usually, tourism planning in Brazil follows the normative perspective in its implementation. This study proposes to integrate the actor-centered power perspective with planning in order to elucidate which are the most powerful social actors and what are their interests in tourism development. Such perspective is enabled through the identification of these actors and their relation with coercion, dominant information, and incentives and disincentives, categories derived from the approaches to power developed by Krott. In order to achieve the objective, interviews were conducted by employing the snowball technique. The research hypothesis is that tourism planning in the Ilha Grande State Park (Rio de Janeiro, Brazil) is directed by the interests of the most powerful social actors. The results confirm such hypothesis and show that there is great conflict of interests between NGOs, Government, and the administration of the Conservation Unit.

**Keywords:** Tourism planning; Actor-centered power; Ilha Grande State Park; Brazil.

#### Resumo

# Planejamento do turismo a partir da perspectiva actor-centered power no Parque Estadual da Ilha Grande, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

Usualmente, o planejamento do turismo no Brasil segue a perspectiva normativa em sua execução. Este estudo propõe integrar a perspectiva *actor-centered power* ao planejamento a fim de elucidar quais são os atores sociais mais poderosos e quais são seus interesses no desenvolvimento turístico. Tal perspectiva é possível por meio da identificação desses atores e de sua relação com a coerção, a informação dominante e incentivos e desincentivos, categorias derivadas das abordagens de poder desenvolvidas por Krott. Para cumprir o objetivo proposto, realizou-se entrevistas mediante a técnica bola de neve. A hipótese de pesquisa é que o planejamento do turismo no Parque Estadual da Ilha Grande (Rio de Janeiro, Brasil) é direcionado pelos interesses dos atores sociais mais poderosos. Os resultados confirmam tal hipótese e demostram que há grande conflito de interesses entre ONGs, governo e administração da Unidade de Conservação. **Palavras-chave:** Planejamento do turismo; *Actor-centered power*; Parque Estadual da Ilha Grande; Brasil.

a. PhD student in Forest Sciences and Forest Ecology at Georg-August-Universität Göttingen, Göttingen, Germany. E-mail: dutracarolina@gmail.com

Adjunct professor at Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de Janeiro, Nova Iguaçu, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. E-mail: debora.rcc@hotmail.com

c. Head of Forest and Nature Conservation Policy Department at the Faculty of Forest Sciences and Forest Ecology at Georg-August-Universität-Göttingen, Göttingen, Germany. E-mail: mkrott@gwdg.de

#### Resumen

# La planificación del turismo a partir de la perspectiva actor-centered power en el Parque Estatal de Isla Grande, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

Por lo general, el planeamiento del turismo en Brasil sigue la perspectiva normativa en su aplicación. Este estudio propone la integración de la perspectiva *actor-centered power* (Krott et al., 2014) a la planificación para dilucidar cuales son los actores sociales más poderosos y cuáles son sus intereses en el desarrollo del turismo. Tal perspectiva es posible a través de la identificación de estos actores y de su relación con la coacción, la información dominante y los incentivos y desincentivos, categorías derivadas de los enfoques del poder desarrollados por Krott (2005). Para cumplir con el objetivo propuesto, se llevó a cabo entrevistas realizadas por medio de la técnica bola de nieve. La hipótesis de la investigación es que la ordenación del turismo en el Parque Estatal de Ilha Grande (Río de Janeiro, Brasil) es dirigida por los intereses de los actores sociales más poderosos. Los resultados confirman esta hipótesis y demuestran que hay un gran conflicto de intereses entre las ONGs, gobierno y administración de la Unidad de Conservación.

**Palabras clave:** Planificación del turismo; *Actor-centered power*; Parque Estatal de Ilha Grande; Brasil.

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Tourism planning in Brazil usually considers the normative perspective based on objectives to be achieved by means of well-defined steps for its implementation (BENI, 2006; BEZERRA, 2003; BRAGA, 2006; PANOSSO NETO; ANSARAH, 2008; PETROCCHI, 1998; RUSCHMANN; SOLHA, 2005;). Politically, the obstacles to this development are many, due to the conflicting interests of the various actors involved in the process. Therefore, the actor-centered power analysis (KRO-TT et al., 2014) emerges as a tool for identification of powerful actors and their interests in the tourism development of a particular location.

The objective of this study is to critically analyze the normative perspective of tourism planning considering the approach to power that takes into account factors such as coercion, dominant information, and incentives.

It is believed that the actor-centered power analysis can be included in public policy planning and development processes, serving as a tool capable of identifying the obstacles to tourism development of a particular location. Usually employed in studies carried out in community forests, the actor-centered power analysis seeks to identify obstacles to the success of a particular project by means of determining actors, interests, and elements of power (KROTT et al., 2014; MARYUDI et al., 2012; SCHUSSER, 2013; SCHUSSER et al., 2015; SCHUSSER et al., 2016).

According to Krott et al. (2014, p. 34), the actor-centered power approach aims to provide a scientific answer that enables identifying the most powerful political actors in a forest community. In this sense, actor-centered power can be defined as a social relationship in which actor A changes the behavior of actor B without recognizing the will of the latter. Therefore, it is an approach to analysis of the actors' interests in relation to a particular political perspective.

In order to achieve the objective of this work, in November 2014 we interviewed nine social actors with influence power on tourism development in the

Ilha Grande State Park (Rio de Janeiro). Respondents were defined through the "snowball" process (the respondent indicates another person to be questioned), and, finally, after the interviews, the data were organized and analyzed according to the actor-centered power approach.

## NORMATIVE PERSPECTIVE OF TOURISM PLANNING IN BRAZIL

Tourism planning in Brazil comes from a recent experience of public policies that were inseparable from the process of creating a specific ministry for the activity. Until the early 2000s, although the country had already tried various initiatives in the area of tourism, there was not yet an exclusive ministry for the sector. From the creation of the department, greater organization of efforts for the design and implementation of public policies was established, and today, more than fifteen years later, some of the results of these initiatives can be discussed.

Public policies for tourism in Brazil are structured based on an economicist and normative perspective. Economicist because the initiatives for organization of the activity are structured based on its economic benefits. And normative because the organization of tourist activity is influenced by organization systems of the sectors that compose it. Exceptions to the rule based on social participation, such as community-based tourism, for example, are rarely implemented with success.

According to Solha (2002, p. 118), the evolution of tourism in Brazil, and, with that, of the public policies for its regulation, can be represented by five different periods:

- 1. Colony and empire (17th and 19th centuries): beginning of the activity with the first flows of travelers and the hospitality towards drovers, in addition to travels of sugar mill lords to Europe;
- 2. From 1900 to 1949: healing and gambling stations, highway expansion, and intensification of travel viwa highways;
- 3. From 1950 to 1969: expansion and organization of tourism with expansion of transport infrastructure, activity organization through associations and through structuring of policies;
- 4. From 1970 to 1989: stagnation of the growth pace observed in the previous period and subsequent decline;
- 5. From 1990 to 2000: growth of the internal market, greater investments in different sectors and exploration of new market segments.

Beni (2006, p. 25-33) brings a retrospective of the development of tourism based on the review of financing and development programs, in an analysis that comprises the period from the 1970s to the early 2000s. According to the author, the public policies of tourism traditionally reflected, at the time, a vision oriented towards the private sector, not taking into consideration the participation of civil society.

Prior to this period, it should be noted some governmental interventions that had direct or indirect effect on tourism, such as the protection of historical and artistic assets and the inspection of ticket sales businesses (1937-1945);

the creation of the Ministry of Justice and Business (1946-1962); the creation of the Ministry of Labor, Industry, and Commerce and the beginning of tourism planning at the national level with the Brazilian Tourism Company (Combratur) (1948-1958), later subordinated directly to the Presidency of the Republic (1959-1966); the creation of the Division of Tourism and Competition of the National Department of Commerce and later the creations of the Brazilian Company of Tourism (Embratur) and of the National Council of Tourism (CNTur), with the definition of a National Policy of Tourism (1963-1966) (BENI, 2006, p. 19-20).

It is important to note that the public management of tourism influences changes in the management of the cultural heritage and of the environment, and that the laws that support these two areas reflect important changes in the tourist activity.

From the 1970s, aiming to attract businessmen from the tourism sector, financing funds were put in place for projects geared towards the development of tourism activity managed by Embratur. However, according to Beni (2006, p. 24), the capital from these incentives were employed almost entirely in luxury hotels, creating a supply that was incompatible with the internal demands and external flows of that time. Among the important initiatives of that decade, it should be noted the creation of laws aimed at the organization and supervision of touristic services and the valorization of areas and sites of touristic interest.

Later, in the 1980s, the transition from military rule to democracy is initiated, with a process of political opening that culminated in the creation of a new Constitution, in which tourism is referred to in Art. 180. The space for debate is then expanded, and the new political organization affects tourism. From the institutional point of view, it was believed that the best configuration for development of the sector would be the organization of a group formed by Embratur, CNTur, and the Ministry of Industry and Trade. Actions are carried out to stimulate domestic tourism and market release for the conduct of touristic activities (BENI, 2006, p. 25-26). Among the initiatives of the period, it is also worth noting the establishment of the National Environment Policy, which influences the formulation of public policies and the organization of tourism.

In both periods (prior to and after the redemocratization), it is observed that – despite the presence of the public sector – tourism planning initiatives were focused on economic activity to the detriment of social aspects. Considering the complex totality that constitutes tourism, this type of initiatives can be considered as reductionist, unable to organize and direct efforts of all sectors of society involved.

In the 1990s, it is observed that official tourism agencies were more active, which, on the other hand, allows verifying the extent to which tourism had not been among the priorities of the Government. In this period, there was the creation of the Ministry of Industry, Trade, and Tourism, the revitalization of the General Fund of Tourism (Fungetur), the presentation of the National Tourism Plan (Plantur), of the Tourism Development Program (Prodetur), and of the Program for Development of Ecotourism in the Legal Amazon (Proecotur). Such programs show the focus on the development of tourism in nature and on fostering the tourism related to sun and beach, vocations that ended up consolidating. In this period, it was also formulated the Parks of Brazil program, which, in a partnership between IBAMA and Embratur proposed actions aimed at generating beneficial social effects for local residents, especially the Iguaçu National Park (BENI, 2006, p. 25-26).

A significant action from this period is the creation of the National Program for Municipalization of Tourism (PNMT), which marks the beginning of the establishment of guidelines for the organization and development of tourism. The idea behind the PNMT was to promote the growth of municipalities through raising the awareness as to the benefits of tourism activities. Accordingly, in order to disseminate those ideals, a large structure of training of multipliers was organized by employing workshops. Based on recommendations of the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), the aim was to carry out a process of internalization of tourism activity. The fact, however, is that the model presupposed a knowledge of the country's space and the touristic vocation, its regions and localities; and, in the workshops, many municipalities declared themselves geared for tourism even before describing their structure and attractions. Additionally, as obstacle to the success of the initiative, it is necessary to consider the great territorial dimension and the difficulty of reconciling so many particularities, as well as to monitor the outcome of the action of multipliers. A particularity of the PNMT is that the tourism municipalization workshops gathered groups of various parts of the country, which in a way favored a locally-based perspective, to the extent that participants established development goals for their destinations and assumed commitments with the multiplication of ideas. On the other hand, a normative perspective is observed in the program, as strategic planning is previously defined, and community participation is limited to the role of informant regarding the regions' touristic potential, with little opportunity to assume an active position in the definition of how the process should be conducted.

In the 2000s, there was the creation of the Ministry of Tourism (with incorporation of Embratur), which started to administer exclusively the promotion of the country and to guide market studies and its implementation. From the creation of the Ministry, an instrument was established for implementation of the National Policy for Tourism, the National Tourism Plan. Since the deployment of the Ministry, three editions of the plan have been released (2003–2007, 2007–2010, and 2013–2016), documents that establish the guidelines for the development of the activity in the country. Basically, the goals of the plans were:

- 2003–2007: Develop the Brazilian touristic product based on regional diversity, in its cultural and natural aspects, stimulate and enable the consumption of the Brazilian touristic product in the national and international markets (BRASIL, 2003, p. 22).
- 2007–2010: Develop the touristic product based on diversity and increase its competitiveness; promote tourism as a factor of social development and enhance the competitiveness of the product (BRASIL, 2007, p. 16).
- 2013–2016: Prepare the Brazilian tourism for mega events; increase the generation of foreign exchange and the arrival of foreign tourists; encourage Brazilians to travel through Brazil, improve the quality and increase the competitiveness of Brazilian tourism.

Briefly readdressing the 2003-2007 Plan, it is worth mentioning the proposal of promoting regional development with the Program for Regionalization of Tourism,

which consisted in establishing an organization of the activity based on the development of touristic regions grouped according to affinities. Considering regionalization as "the organization of geographical space into regions for the purposes of planning, management, promotion, and integrated and shared marketing of touristic activity" (BENI, 2006, p. 30), for implementation of the plan regional governance mechanisms were proposed aiming at the decentralization of management.

However, the implementation of these policies was not consolidated. Although the activity's organization framework has been enriched and structured, in practice, with exceptions, there has been weak coordination between municipalities, touristic regions, and inducing destinations. Small and medium-sized municipalities, in particular, continued to plan tourism activities inappropriately (ALMEI-DA; COSTA, 2007, p. 2).

Beni (2006, p. 30) attributes the problems to lack of training of local teams, an opinion corroborated by Almeida and Costa (2007, p. 7), who indicate as a downside of the program the deficient professional qualification of human resources, which ultimately had direct effect on the quality of the touristic supply, which was reflected the evaluation presented in the 2003-2007 Plan. In this sense, the actor-centered power analysis can be a tool to identify in micro-level (that is, in regions and municipalities) how power relations influence the implementation of policies.

This political scenario is permeated by a conceptual plan, that is, by an academic debate that provides references concerning the best planning conducts. The guidelines reflected in the public policies are influenced by theoretical aspects, and, in Brazil, we can say that the hegemonic model is anchored in the theory of systems. According to Gets (apud LOHMANN; NETTO 2008, p. 27), there are 150 models of approaches to tourism found in English-language publications and that are divided into three groups: (1) theoretical models; (2) planning processes; (3) prediction models. Present in three groups, the theory of systems – in addition to being the most widely accepted and discussed in academia as a whole, characterized as the reference theoretical model – was the approach that with greater receptivity in Brazil's public policies.

Reflecting the theory of systems, the System of Tourism (Sistur) aims to explain the relations between tourism, other disciplines, and human activities. The system, configured as open, is composed of three sets: (1) set of environmental relations and their subsystems – cultural, social, economic, and environmental; (2) set of structural organization and its subsystems – the superstructure (private and public) and the infrastructure (urban services, sanitation, road and transport system, territorial organization, tourism infrastructure); (3) set of operational relations, in which the dynamics of tourism occurs, consisting of subsystems of supply, demand, market, production, distribution, consumption.

The 2007-2010 National Tourism Plan, whose structure is obtained from a decentralized management, organized into Macro Programs, Thematic Chamber, Projects and Actions, denotes an attempt to follow a systemic orientation. Nevertheless, despite the theoretical perspective adopted, it can be said that the economic goals (prevalent in the Brazilian policies for tourism) eventually prevailed. According to Molina (2001, p. 39), one of the challenges of management is in the joint development of all subsystems, since the application of public policies tends to prioritize one of the parts of the system. The first version of the National Tourism Plan included as objective the consideration of aspects such as quality,

diversification of supply, structuring of destinations, qualification of workforce, and increase of competitiveness at national and international level, in addition to increase of tourists' rate of stay and mean expenditure.

Considering tourism as an open system in which there are interrelations between sets (Figure 1), we can relate the theory of systems to the three major groups represented in the organization of the National Tourism Plan: (1) Institutional Management and Relations, (2) Promotion of activity, and (3) Infrastructure. An analogy between the sets which comprehend the many tourism activities in comparison with the NTP working fields is therefore sought.

Figure 1 presents the system that seeks to structure tourism activities. However, in the set of environmental relations in contrast with the policies expressed in the NTP, it is observed that there is no structure that seeks to harmonize the set, since the macro-programs are dedicated to the set of operational relations. Considering that, from the macro level, the main fields of action require other segmented actions, the system proves restricted. Although actions that encompass the entire system can be identified at the micro-level, it is deduced that this organization promotes the centralization of the most powerful agents to the detriment of community-based proposals, for example.

**Group of Environmental Relations Ecological** Social **Economical** Cultural Group of **Operational Relations** Group of Structural Organization Market Demand Supply Superstructure Input Output Production Consumption Infrastructure Distribution

Figure 1 - Tourism system

Source - Beni (1998, p. 48)

The National Tourism Plan resulted in the organization of a Plan for Regionalization of Tourism Supply which comprises Ilha Grande as part of the Costa Verde region, a destination associated with tourism focused on sun and beach and on aspects of nature. The plan proposes the regional grouping of destinations according to their vocations, which, on the one hand, enables the creation of touristic products and, on the other, reinforces a perspective centered on the most powerful agents, as can be verified below.

The focus on operational relations, according to Bursztyn (2005, p. 91), characterizes the recurrent view that efficient tourism planning should aim to achieve the economic benefits of tourism activities. In the context of public policies, there is the customary discourse in which tourism is treated as an end, rather than as a means to improve the living conditions of the residents of touristic locations.

# APPROACH TO POWER AND ACTOR-CENTERED POWER: COERCION, INCENTIVES AND DISINCENTIVES, DOMINANT INFORMATION

For the purposes of this study, power is assumed as an actor's capacity of changing another actor's behavior without recognizing the will of the latter. The potentate is the one who exerts power, while the subordinate receives it. This sort of power, of political character, is exerted in daily life and at local level. According to Bramwell and Meyer (2007, p. 769),

power emerges from social relations, at the same time being supported by specific patterns of distribution of resources and competition. The social interactions that reflect power relations can be imbued with values, meanings, authority, and control.

These actions occur through coercion ("alter another actor's behavior by force"), incentives and disincentives ("alter another actor's behavior by providing advantages or disadvantages"), and dominant information ("alter another actor's behavior due to one's information, accepted without verification") (SCHUSSER et al., 2015, p. 6). Such power relations can occur at various levels, as in actors that relate with one another based on common interests or through associations and NGOs, for example. Heterogeneous relations are greater than individual ones.

The actor's power and interests can direct the planning of touristic activity, providing guidelines for the design of tourism and of public policies. The research is a way to show the hidden interests and the power of important actors, since "the awareness of power relations helps to find the right actors that can support a specific solution politically" (KROTT et al., 2014, p. 2). Therefore, according to Krott et al. (2014, p. 2), actor-centered power is an approach that:

- Specifies the power process and its elements (by describing its constitution, it can be understood what kind of power is established and how it can be manipulated).
- Indicates power connections with specific actors (identifies which part of power is connected to a particular actor).

- Differs between power and other resources (not all resources are a sign of power).
- Observes empirical incidents that suggest the presence of power (empirical observation is a tool to determine the presence of power).

For the purposes of this study, power has three main characteristics (coercion, incentives and disincentives, dominant information) described below.

#### Coercion

Coercion is the threat of force, use of force, or of monitoring, which can lead to fines or imprisonment. A touristic area that is "exclusive," where the entry of visitors is prohibited by means of obstacles (such as fences, for example) and by threat of force or by force (with security guards hired for this purpose), can be an example of location where there are forms of coercion.

Some types of coercion are widely observable in the political process, others are secret. Certain forces within social relations are a precondition for the presence of power: technical force, for example, corresponds to technical knowledge, and financial force, decisive in a context in which the richest will obtain victories. Those actors who have technical knowledge or financial conditions are more likely to use coercion against individuals or groups. However, technical influence should not to be confused with coercive power. In order to distinguish them, coercive force is assumed as that which can change a given agent's behavior regardless of this agent's beliefs. Coercion can be applied by an individual or a network of formal and informal allies, being capable of determining a wide field of power that is observable. Thus, the actors endowed with power, responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the law, may provide for sanctions over others (KROTT et al. 2014, p. 5).

## Incentives and disincentives

Disincentives are imposed irrespective of the will of the actors affected and alter the behavior of the individual. For example, the reasons for the prohibition to build in a certain location are often unknown. However, whether the justifications for the norm are known or unknown, the fact is that violation of the law may lead the individual to be fined. One's own will is of no consequence in this case, and the individual is obliged to accept the disadvantage due to the risk of sanctions.

On the other hand, incentives occur when the potentate offers financial advantages in order to obtain a specific behavior from a specific actor (KROTT et al. 2014, p. 5). Real estate speculation and gentrification, realities in Brazil and Ilha Grande, are examples of incentives in which holders of financial resources can change the behavior of disadvantaged actors thus configuring particular power relations.

Resources, more than agreements, are the cause of the subordinate's changes of behavior. There are, however, internal conflicts on the part of the affected actors, who, due to not having their will fulfilled, will not support the sanctions to which they are subject (KROTT et al. 2014, p. 6).

#### **Dominant Information**

An actor can be manipulated by another through unverified information. If the subordinate makes a decision or changes behavior based on unverified information provided by the potentate, a power relationship is established. Such relation can lead the subordinate to become dependent on the potentate, as in the case of ideological, politically important discourses, which generate a relation of trust between the actors.

The voluntary process of verifying information is less important than the mandatory abstention. The subordinate is usually obliged to accept this information due to the lack of direct relevant information or lack of methods or resources. Specialized knowledge is an example, as most of the community is composed of individuals with no formal education. Specialists have the information and are capable of verifying it, while the others can only believe them. (KROTT et al. 2014, p. 6)

This type of domination, however, is not always established. In the process of power, dominant information can sometimes be used in favor of interests of the subordinate. Local communities, for example, can obtain specialized advice that can help them. Nevertheless, if the behavior of these communities is highly influenced by the expert's will, a process of power can be established again. The local community is exposed to the potentate's power whenever it forgets or deliberately does not want to verify the information received (DEVKOTA, 2010 apud KROTT et al. 2014, p. 7).

The actor-centered power approach is directly related to the actors that act as subordinates or potentates, depending on their sources of power. The most powerful actors can be identified by the accumulation of functions as potentate. The model does not presuppose, however, that the most powerful actors are always so, since, in specific situations, it is possible that they act as subordinates. This hypothesis is verified by means of observations in which a specific actor can dominate for some time, but not always or in all situations (SCHUSSER et al., 2015, p. 3). The role of potentate can therefore be a temporary condition.

Power relations are only considered as such when an actor's behavior is modified by another through coercion, incentives or disincentives, and dominant information.

#### **METHODS**

Ilha Grande is part of the municipality of Angra dos Reis (RJ), located in the region known as Costa Verde (Figure 2), one of the most visited areas of Rio de Janeiro.



Figure 2 - Location of Ilha Grande according to Touristic Regions of Rio de Janeiro

**Source** - Adapted from Turisrio

The Ilha Grande State Park (PEIG), object of study of this research, was created through Decree No. 15,273 of June 28, 1971, demarcated by Decree No. 16,067 of June 4, 1973 and established by Decree No. 2,061 of August 25, 1978, occupying 5,594 of the 19,300 hectares of the island's total area. Its 34 points, seven coves, and 106 beaches are its greatest natural attractions, visited mostly during the summer. The Pedra d'Água Peak and the Papagaio Peak are the highest ones, with 1,031 and 982 meters, respectively. Its climate is tropical, hot and humid, with no dry season. Air temperature ranges from 15°C to 30°C and the annual average is 22.5°C. The average temperature of sea water ranges from 18°C to 24°C. Sunny days range from 180 to 200 per year (PROGRAMA NACIONAL DO MEIO AMBIENTE, 1997; UFRRJ, 1993).

In 2007, the PEIG was expanded by 6,458 hectares, and from then occupied 12,072 hectares of the territory of Ilha Grande. Its administration, previously subordinate to the State Institute of Forests (IEF), became the responsibility of the State Institute of the Environment (Inea), an agency connected to the State Secretary of the Environment (SEA). Second largest Brazilian insular park, the PEIG is considered an Atlantic Forest Biosphere Reserve by UNESCO since 1992 and landmarked as patrimony of the state of Rio de Janeiro since 1987 (INEA, 2013, p. 13-18).

Mass tourism in Ilha Grande began after shutting down the Cândido Mendes Penal Institute in 1994. In fact, there has always been touristic activity in the island, but the existence of the prison kept most tourists away. After 1994, tourism grew rapidly and spontaneously, showing a new scenario to the inhabitants of the island. With the location converted into a touristic destination, many interested parties started investing in construction, initiating a great transformation in the landscape and in the social life of the residents.

After the growth of tourism, many actors with conflicting interests began to emerge: NGOs dedicated to nature conservation were created, protected areas

were established, and, while entrepreneurs needed more customers, residents wanted a quiet life or work with tourism.

In order to conduct this study, interviews with nine social actors considered most powerful were carried out in November 2014. The actors were selected through snowball process, initiated with a representative of the State Institute of the Environment, the greater entity related to the PEIG, manager of the Conservation Unit. Based on the representative's indications, other actors were selected for interview.

According to Vinuto (2014, p. 201), the non-probability sampling technique called snowball uses reference chains in order to access groups of actors in a nonquantifiable universe. Thus, when sampling was initiated with the representative of the institution that administrates the PEIG, it was possible to identify a chain of references in which an actor mentions others with common interests or that provide support to that institution, generating a network of collaborators. It is usually employed in research of sociological content, especially when seeking the knowledge of private or internal activities, which require the contribution of local actors so respondents are located and identified (BIERNACKI; WALDORF, 1981, p. 141).

The interviews were recorded with permission of respondents and had an average duration of 50 minutes. The goal was to understand the power relations between the respondents and their interests with respect to the development of tourism in the Park. The snowball process enabled the identification of powerful actors, which mutually support one other during the interviews. The institutions mentioned were:

- Liga Cultural Afro-Brasileira [Afro-Brazilian Cultural League]: association of cultural nature aimed at the encouragement of capoeira, ring-around-the-rosy, cinema, and the construction of a library.
- Associação dos Meios de Hospedagem da Ilha Grande (AMHIG) (Association
  of Accommodations Services of Ilha Grande): association/representative of
  other groups composed of twenty innkeepers at Vila do Abraão. Seeks to
  provide professional training to innkeepers and aims to preserve the environment, as it believes that nature is the main attraction of Ilha Grande.
- Brigada Mirim Ecológica (Ecological Child Brigade): association that provides diverse activities (agriculture, mariculture, and environmental education) to youth aged fourteen to seventeen years. Participants distribute pamphlets to tourists about environmental education and garbage bags.
- Comitê de Defesa da Ilha Grande (Codig) (Ilha Grande Defense Committee): NGO dedicated to environmental, social, and touristic issues.
- Associação Curupira de Guias e Condutores de Visitantes da Ilha Grande (Curupira Association of Guides and informal guides of Visitors of Ilha Grande): association that includes guides accredited by Embratur and informal guides.

- Instituto Estadual do Ambiente (Inea) State Institute of the Environment: public/touristic administration that manages the PEIG.
- Organização para a Sustentabilidade da Ilha Grande (Osig) (Organization for the Sustainability of Ilha Grande): Environmental NGO geared towards local sustainability issues.
- O Eco newspaper: media outlet dedicated to addressing issues relevant to the development of Ilha Grande.
- Fundação de Turismo de Angra dos Reis (TurisAngra) (Angra dos Reis Tourism Foundation): public administration agency that aims to manage tourism by developing policies and advertising destinations.

The following table was prepared in order to theoretically classify the types of actors that can exert power over a touristic location.

Chart 1 - Theoretical classification of the social actors, definitions, and examples

Actor	Definition	Example				
Political						
Politician	Actor that is elected by the people to exercise public mandate and can legitimize decisions.	Government and ministers, political parties representations, congress, etc.				
Public administration	Public actor that makes decisions about specific issues based on general legal norms, solving problems and implementing specific measures (KROTT, 2005).	Nature conservation authority, land use authority, agriculture authority, police, military, etc.				
Tourism administration	Public administration focused on management of visitation.	Department of tourism, tourism office, tourism directory.				
Traditional leader	Actor legitimized to exercise public mandate and that can legitimize decisions in a community.	Leaders of villages, healers, traditional authority, religious leader, etc.				
Council	Actor consisting of politicians, traditional or administrative leaders with public mandate.	Tourism council, land use council, public control council, environment council, etc.				
Donor organization	Actor that provides financial resources for the resolution of problems.	National and international banks and other organizations.				
Association	Actor that coordinates the interests of the group that it represents and tries to implement them through lobby with politicians and public administration (KROTT, 2005).	Tourism association, Hotels association, Residents association, Environment association, etc.				

(continues...)

**Chart 1 - Continuation** 

Actor	Definition	Example					
Support association	Actor that can be characterized as association, but also provides funds for solution of problems.	NGOs and OSCIPs**.					
Economical	Economical						
Representative of groups of local communities	Actor that coordinates the interests of the groups of local communities and tries to implement them.	Management committees of local communities, development committee, committee for nature conservation, managing council, etc.					
Representative of other groups	Actor that coordinates the interests of other groups of local communities and tries to implement them.						
Tourism entrepreneur	Actor that uses tourism to maximize profits.	Hotels, restaurants, operators, travel agencies, diving schools, cruise ships, boat rentals, event planning, and other related services.					
Consulting	Actor that provides information, funds, and management to another actor.	Consultancies.					
Social							
Research institution	Actor that provides science-based knowledge.	Universities, research centers, etc.					
Media	Actors that distribute and produce information.	National and international media, such as newspapers, magazines, radio stations, TV channels, etc.					
Religious organization	Actor that provides spiritual or religious assistance.	Churches, mosques, religious or spiritual associations, etc.					
Visitor	Actor that influences the economic and social aspects of a community in seeking leisure.	Tourists and owners of second homes.					

**Source** - Adapted from Schusser et al. (2015)

# **RESULTS**

Based on field observation, some actors of the PEIG could be observed. The distribution of these actors into categories is presented below.

Chart 2 - Political, economic, and social actors in the Ilha Grande State Park

Actor	Actor in the Ilha Grande State Park
Political	
Politician	President, governor, mayor, submayor, etc.

(continues...)

**Chart 2 – Continuation** 

Actor	Actor in the Ilha Grande State Park		
Public administration	Inea*, federal, state, and municipal governments, Subprefecture, Prosecutor, Secretary of Tourism, etc.		
Tourism administration	Inea*, TurisAngra*, Ilha Grande Convention and Visitors Bureau, etc.		
Traditional leader	Caiçaras.		
Council	Ilha Grande State Park Advisory Council, Tamoios Environmental Protection Area Advisory Council, Mosaico da Bocaina Advisory Council, etc.		
Donor organization	Vale, Termorio, KfW, Tetra Pak, Klabin, Eletronuclear etc.		
Association	Brigada Mirim Ecológica*, AMAIG, AMHIG*, Curupira*, Apeb, IACV, Isabi, Amav, Amotap, AMVDR, AAPAA, Liga Cultural Afro-Brasileira* etc.		
Support association	Cio da Terra, Codig*, Sape, Parceiros da Terra, Osig*, Consig etc.		
Economical			
Representative of groups of local communities	AMAIG, Fishermen Association, Piajig, OPA, etc.		
Representative of other groups	ABIG, AMHIG*, etc.		
Tourism entrepreneurs	Hotels, restaurants, tourism operators and agencies, etc.		
Consultant	Agência 21, Sebrae, Instituto BioAtlântica, Instituto Ondular, Consultoria Ambiental, etc.		
Social:			
Research institution	Uerj, Ceads, etc.		
Media	O Eco*, etc.		
Religious organization	Catholic and Protestant churches, etc.		
Visitors	Tourists and owners of second homes.		

<sup>\*</sup>Actors interviewed

For the purposes of this study, we listed the actors and their level of support (observed empirically) to tourism planning. The actors were classified into three levels of support:

- High: fully supports tourism planning in Ilha Grande.
- Medium: partially supports tourism planning in Ilha Grande.
- Low: does not support tourism planning in Ilha Grande.

For the actor-centered power analysis, the following criteria were defined for each element of power, related to each actor's interests in the development of tourism in Ilha Grande:

- Coercion (legal rights): high, medium, low, or nonexistent.
- Incentives and disincentives (financial means): high, medium, low, or nonexistent.

 Dominant information (expertise and knowledge): high, medium, low, or nonexistent.

Chart 3 gathers the results according to the interviews conducted.

**Chart 3** – Power and support elements for tourism planning on the part of respondents

Actor	Tourism planning support	Coercion	Incentives and disincentives	Dominant information
Liga Cultural Afro-Brasileira	High	Nonexistent	Low	Low
AMHIG	High	Medium	Low	Low
Brigada Mirim Ecológica	High	Medium	Medium	Medium
Codig	High	Medium	Low	High
Associação Curupira	High	Low	Low	Medium
Inea	High	High	High	High
Osig	High	Medium	Medium	High
O Eco	High	Medium	Low	High
TurisAngra	High	High	High	High

As can be observed, all the actors interviewed support tourism planning, especially the implementation of load capacity study, mentioned by all as essential for the organization of regional tourism in Ilha Grande, whose number of visitors exceeds that desired by the interviewees.

### Actor-centered power analysis

When describing the constitution of power and of its elements, the actor-centered power analysis comprehends and specifies the types of power established and indicates how these can be manipulated.

Through the interviews, it could be observed that the most powerful actors in Ilha Grande's touristic activity are the Inea and the TurisAngra, institutions that have conditions to influence other actors through coercion, incentives or disincentives, and dominant information. Due to being administrator of the PEIG, the Inea obtains advantages with its positioning, and can direct public policies to the location. The TurisAngra has the power to interfere with Ilha Grande's touristic activities due to being the public agency responsible for its administration. The greatest expression of power of Inea and TurisAngra is dominant information, as both actors have technical knowledge that cannot be verified by other actors, especially the local community, which relies on this information. Coercion can be used by Inea in the form of establishment of rules for use and behavior in the PEIG and can be observed in the monitoring and in the incentives and disincentives in the form of fines for those who do not meet the norms established.

# Power connections for specific actors

By tracing the power connections for specific actors, it can be identified which part of power (coercion, incentives and disincentives, and dominant information) is connected to a particular actor. Table 3 identifies the elements of power and links them to their respective actors, indicating the governmental institutions as most powerful, followed by the nongovernmental organizations. The least powerful are the associations and the local media. However, power relations are changeable over time, that is, actors switch their power impact according to the political or economic situation at local or national level.

# Differences between power and other characteristics

Noteworthy, not all resources are a sign of power. The NGOs interviewed (Codig, Osig, and Brigada Mirim Ecológica) and the O Eco newspaper are not considered powerful according to individual analysis of their elements; however, they exert significant pressure on public authorities with regard to directing public policies for Ilha Grande, with major dominant information. On the other hand, the performance of TurisAngra, considered as powerful, was characterized as "underwhelming" by one of the interviewees, since its interference with planning processes is minimal, considering its high power load. Nevertheless – regardless of the effectiveness of such comment –, TurisAngra and Inea are still the institutions that really have the power to change the behavior of other actors through the elements mentioned. The PEIG has an advisory council and, despite all the actors interviewed being part and participating actively in the agency, the final decision is always the responsibility of the Inea, and as a result the local community's demands are not always met.

### Observation of empirical incidents

Empirical observations are a tool to determine the presence of power. The interviews are directed to the actors in order to identify each actor's means for each element of power. Analysis of statutes and contracts of services can also be used in this identification. The interviews are aimed at identifying which actors mutually support one another and which are more influential in the current local touristic scene, in addition to their interests, often hidden, but that can be observed empirically. Table 3 presents the most powerful actors, forming a support network that perpetuates this power in relation to other actors. Inea and TurisAngra are the most powerful and theoretically would be great partners; notwithstanding, the interviews showed that the Inea usually obtains more support from the NGOs listed, because their interests in relation to the development of tourism are closer.

The scenario analyzed in the PEIG can be compared with the case of Indonesia, where the conflict of interests of the actors involved leads to obstacles in the management of protected areas. In order to mitigate these conflicts, two public policies aimed at encouraging community participation were developed: return

(management system that prioritizes the local knowledge to conserve the biodiversity) and decentralization (flexibility of power from the central government to regions) (EVANS et al. apud KUSTANTI et al., 2014, p. 154).

In Canada, Reed (1997, p. 579) points out that the major barrier to the development of tourism was the lack of support from high-level government agencies so as to release land for specific initiatives, in addition to the frustration regarding the lack of cooperation to identify local needs, specifically in the province of Squamish. Conflict of interests in the development of tourism is also discussed as being one of the barriers to planning. While some actors wish to maintain the location's original characteristics, others argue that major touristic facilities are installed.

In Lombok, a small island in Indonesia, the authors highlight the social costs of tourism as a tool for development in developing countries through the analysis of types of power and their effects on different actors. The negative effects of tourism in small islands can be extreme depending on the sociocultural characteristics of the local population, which could suffer with the structure of power exerted over its territory (HAMPTON; JEYACHEYA, 2015, p. 481).

It is important to note that the problems related to obstacles to tourism planning in Ilha Grande are similar to the aforementioned cases and, possibly, to others in Brazil and in developing countries. The case of the PEIG, therefore, can be a reference for similar studies in other islands and protected areas, where power relations can be analyzed according to the methodology presented.

# **CONCLUSION**

The normative theories of tourism planning in Brazil allow for a clear vision of the steps to be followed for the implementation of tourism in different locations. However, interests of powerful actors can direct this process more than the plan itself. In this scenario, identification of the actors and their elements of power (coercion, incentives and disincentives, and dominant information) is a useful tool to determine the interests involved.

The normative perspective of tourism planning, focused on market relations, is effective in its theoretical principles, because it provides an integrated view created based on structures of organization of the knowledge of the activity. This perspective had an important role, organizing a whole complex composed of different sectors of the economy. However, as stated above, tourism planning in the PEIG has not reached the expected results due to the conflicting interests of the various actors involved in the process.

Ilha Grande has actors interested in diverse development scenarios, which, at times, can be conflicting, hindering the planning process. It is necessary a more in-depth research concerning these interests, especially taking into account that Ilha Grande – in addition to the PEIG – is a mosaic of villages, each with its distinct cultural and social aspects. Therefore, tourism planning and conflict resolution require an in-depth analysis of the actors involved and of their interests related to development, so success can be achieved in practice.

#### **REFERENCES**

ALMEIDA, É.; COSTA, C. O planejamento turístico entre os municípios brasileiros de pequena e média dimensão. *Revista Acadêmica do Observatório de Inovação do Turismo*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 2, n. 1, p. 1-20, 2007.

BENI, M. C. Política e planejamento do turismo no Brasil. São Paulo: Aleph, 2006.

BEZERRA, D. M. F. (Org.). Planejamento e gestão em turismo. São Paulo: Roca, 2003.

BIERNACKI, P.; WALDORF, D. Snowball sampling: problems and techniques of chain referral sampling. *Sociological methods and research*, [s. l.], v. 10, n. 2, p. 141-163, 1981.

BRAGA, D. C. *Planejamento turístico*: teoria e prática. Rio de Janeiro: Campus, 2006.

BRAMWELL, B., MEYER, D. Power and tourism policy relations in transition. *Annals of Tourism Research*, Amsterdam, v. 34, n. 3, p. 766-788, 2007.

BRASIL. Ministério do Turismo. *Plano Nacional de Turismo*: 2007-2010. Brasília: Ministério do Turismo, 2007. Disponível em: <a href="http://bit.ly/2nfyGkF">http://bit.ly/2nfyGkF</a>>. Acesso em: 4 abr. 2016.

BRASIL. Ministério do Turismo. *Plano Nacional do Turismo*: diretrizes, metas e programas: 2003-2007. Brasília: Ministério do Turismo, 2003. Disponível em: <a href="http://bit.ly/2nXr9Ed">http://bit.ly/2nXr9Ed</a>. Acesso em: 4 abr. 2016.

BURSZTYN, I. *Políticas Públicas de Turismo visando a Inclusão Social*. 2005. Dissertação (Mestrado em Ciências em Engenharia de Produção) – Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, 2005.

HAMPTON, M. P.; JEYACHEYA, J. Power, ownership and tourism in small islands: evidence from Indonesia. *World Development*, London, v. 70, p. 481-495, 2015.

INEA – INSTITUTO ESTADUAL DO AMBIENTE. *Parque Estadual da Ilha Grande (PEIG)*: Plano de manejo (fase 2). Rio de Janeiro: Inea, 2013. Disponível em: <a href="http://bit.ly/2n-7lAF0">http://bit.ly/2n-7lAF0</a>>. Acesso em: 20 mar. 2017.

KROTT, M. Forest policy analysis. Dordrecht: Springer, 2005.

KROTT, M. et al. Actor-centred power: the driving force in decentralized community based forest governance. *Forest Policy and Economics*, Amsterdam, v. 49, p. 34-42, 2014.

KUSTANTI, A. et al. Actor, interest and conflict in sustainable mangrove forest management: a case from Indonesia. *International Journal of Marine Science*, British Columbia, v. 4, n. 16, p. 150-159, 2014.

LOHMANN, G.; NETTO, A. *Teoria do turismo*: conceitos, modelos e sistemas. São Paulo: Aleph, 2008.

MARYUDI, A. et al. Back to basics: considerations in evaluating the outcomes of community forestry. *Forest Policy and Economics*, Amsterdam, v. 14, n. 1, p. 1-5, 2012.

MOLINA, S. *Planejamento integral do turismo*: um enfoque para a América Latina. Bauru: Edusc, 2001.

PANOSSO NETO, A.; ANSARAH, M. G. R. (Org.). *Segmentação do mercado turístico*: estudos, produtos e perspectivas. São Paulo: Manole, 2008.

PETROCCHI, M. *Turismo*: planejamento e gestão. São Paulo: Futura, 1998.

PROGRAMA NACIONAL DO MEIO AMBIENTE. *Programa de gestão para o desenvolvimento sustentável da bacia contribuinte à baía da Ilha Grande*: volume 1: diagnóstico ambiental da baía da Ilha Grande. Brasília: SEMA, 1997.

REED, M. G. Power relations and community-based tourism planning. *Annals of Tourism Research*, Amsterdam, v. 24, n. 3, p. 566-591, 1997.

RUSCHMANN, D.; SOLHA, K. T. Planejamento turístico. Barueri: Manole, 2005.

SCHUSSER, C. Who determines biodiversity? An analysis of actor's power and interests in community forestry in Namibia. *Forest Policy and Economics*, Amsterdam, v. 36, p. 42-51, 2013.

SCHUSSER, C. et al. Comparing community forestry actors in Cameroon, Indonesia, Namibia, Nepal and Germany. *Forest Policy and Economics*, Amsterdam, v. 68, p. 81-87, 2016.

SCHUSSER, C. et al. Powerful stakeholders as drivers of community forestry: results of an international study. *Forest Policy and Economics*, Amsterdam, v. 58, p. 92-101, 2015.

SOLHA, K. T. Evolução do Turismo no Brasil. In: REJOWSKI, M. (Org.) *Turismo no percurso do tempo*. São Paulo: Aleph, 2002. p. 117-152.

UFRRJ – UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL RURAL DO RIO DE JANEIRO. *Plano diretor do Parque Estadual da Ilha Grande*. Rio de Janeiro: UFRRJ, 1993.

VINUTO, J. A amostragem em bola de neve na pesquisa qualitativa: um debate em aberto. *Temáticas*, Campinas, v. 44, p. 203-220, 2014.

Received on: May 10, 2016 Approved on: March 16, 2017